

Introduction

Remapping the History of North
American Oneness Pentecostalism

Lloyd D. Barba, Andrea Shan Johnson, and Daniel Ramírez

There was an inaudible shudder that swept the preachers on the platform
and the people in the vast arena.

—FRANK EWART

On August 24, 2013, a group of Pentecostals gathered in Hermon Park in the Arroyo Seco area of Los Angeles. There to commemorate the centennial of the modern revelation of Jesus' name baptism, attendees were treated to a reenactment of R. E. McAlister's 1913 sermon calling for the use of the recovered baptismal formula, and were invited to witness the baptisms of new converts. They also partook in the dedication of a permanent park bench to commemorate the historic events at Maria Woodworth-Etter's 1913 camp meeting.¹ Less formal than the Azusa Street Revival 2006 centennial, the commemoration was a reminder that a heterodox theology challenging accepted Trinitarian views of the godhead had emerged during the Progressive Era, had survived two world wars and the Great Depression, and now projected significant influence in the global Pentecostal Movement.

In 1913, the land that is now Hermon Park lay between the rapidly growing cities of Los Angeles and Pasadena. Electric rail lines would have facilitated attendance from within the two cities' region. It was a good choice of location

for a revival. However, Los Angeles was host to many religious spectacles, a phenomenon that muckraking novelist Upton Sinclair would complain about in his 1917 work *The Profits of Religion*. It is likely that the camp meeting, like so many others held in the region, would have faded from historical memory were it not for the controversy that arose there concerning the proper mode of baptism.

The best eyewitness account of the revival came from Frank Ewart, an Australian immigrant who had recently begun pastoring the late William Durham's Upper Room Mission in Los Angeles. Amid the emerging controversy, he spread the Jesus' name message in his periodical *Meat in Due Season* (see fig. I.1). Ewart's 1947 *The Phenomenon of Pentecost: A History of the Latter Rain*, is the earliest known insider history of the Oneness Movement and of the catalytic moment at Arroyo Seco. Ewart recalled, "There was an inaudible shudder that swept the preachers on the platform and the people in the vast arena," when Canadian evangelist R. E. McAlister proclaimed that the Apostles baptized in the "Name of Jesus Christ" rather than with the titles of Father, Son, and Holy Ghost. Ewart remembered that Frank Denny, a missionary to China, immediately went to McAlister and told him to cease, lest the revival be associated with a Dr. Sykes.² While Ewart was mistaken about the doctoral honorific, Denny had identified a serious concern. Joshua Sykes, one of the region's many revivalists, had arrived in California around the time of the Azusa Street Revival and established himself as a religious upstart. His Apostolic Church (later called the Church of the Living God) practiced baptism "in the name of Christ," spoke in tongues, believed in visions as answers to prayer, made improbable claims to the miraculous, and had a suspect sense of morality. In May 1914, Sykes, facing legal troubles in Los Angeles, would deem it necessary to decamp with his extensive congregation to the San Francisco Bay Area, where his troublesome reputation continued to grow. If a shudder swept through the ministers on the platform that day, it is likely that the inspiration (or specter) was Sykes rather than the Holy Spirit.³

The Pentecostal Movement would soon have a greater problem than association with the controversial Sykes. The recovery of the proper baptismal formula led to a reexamination of ideas about the godhead. As primitivists, Oneness adherents pointed to scriptural examples such as Acts 2:38, 4:12, 10:44–48, and 19:1–6 to argue that the name of Jesus should be proclaimed over the baptized. They argued that the godhead was not a Trinity with three distinct persons, but rather that Father, Son, and Holy Spirit were manifestations of one God. The "New Issue" prompted mutual epithets and charges: "Jesus Only" and tritheism. As the debate heated up in 1914, its expansion coincided with the

MEAT IN DUE SEASON

Vol. 1, No. 9

Los Angeles, Cal., December, 1915

Circulation Free

WHY I WAS RE-BAPTIZED, IN THE NAME OF JESUS CHRIST
I have been requested to give a condensed statement of my reason for being baptized again, this time in the name of Jesus Christ. It would be a satisfaction to go into detail in the matter, but unfortunately space forbids. I must condense. I may say I never had much sympathy with any sort of matter. Like many others this sort of ceremony did not seem very important to me. I was ignorant as to the real object of baptism. But I have found that obedience, even in the smallest detail, means something. There

water baptism meant that I had never had before. When I was baptized over twenty years ago my whole thought was to confess Christ. I was fully converted. But now I seemed to see a real death with Jesus, separation from the world, and from Pentecostal gainstayers even, such as I had never dreamed of before. It was real death. Romans 6:3 was made very plain to me. I can truly say that I have never known such content and willingness and glory in being dead to praise and blame, to the opinions of the people, and to everything but the will of God, as I do today. I praise Him! Separated unto God.

THE REVELATION OF GOD IN OUR LORD JESUS CHRIST
Evangelist L. C. Hall

Which God?
Jesus said: "Hear, O Israel: the Lord our God is one Lord." Mark 12:29. This He said was the first commandment.
Hoses said: "Thou shalt have no other gods beside me."
Not us.
Isaiah said: "Thus saith the Lord, the King of Israel, and His redeemer the Lord of Hosts; I am the first and I am the last, and beside me there is no God." Is. 44:6.
How much the following sounds like

mediate between God and man, in each of which the divine fulness was abridged and the divine glory shadded in proportion to the remoteness from God in successive emanation.
Thank God for the scales that are falling from the believers' eyes when this fulness of the Godhead is revealed in Him, where "Dwells all the fulness of the Godhead bodily."

"O wondrous sight, a blissful sight
Of our almighty's throne!
There sits the Saviour, crowned with light,
Clothed in a body like our own.

Fig. 1.1. Frank Ewart's periodical *Meat in Due Season* reached all corners of the Pentecostal Movement, advancing the Jesus' name message to missionaries, who in turn, submitted reports about their revivals abroad. Photo courtesy of Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center.

attempt by several Pentecostal groups to merge under a single umbrella. The nascent Assemblies of God (AG) would spend the first two years of its existence trying to unify the two factions until 1916, when its leaders issued a sixteen-point "Statement of Fundamental Truths" that flatly rejected Oneness theology as heresy.⁴

Many Oneness Pentecostals who left the AG found a ready home in the already-existing Pentecostal Assemblies of the World (PAW). Since large portions of the African American Pentecostal Movement embraced the Oneness doctrine, the PAW became not only the premier Oneness group but also one of the more integrated denominations in the United States. Other ministers had met in Arkansas in 1917 and formed the General Assembly of Apostolic Assemblies (GAAA), but this group merged with the PAW soon thereafter, driven in part by the need to use the established PAW name to guarantee exemption from World War I military service for their largely pacifist membership. This short-lived experiment in interracial cooperation stands out against the national backdrop of the time. Nevertheless, as with American Protestantism generally, the prophetic light would soon be eclipsed in the encroaching shadow of Jim Crow.

Oneness adherents from historically Black and white denominations would recognize this origin story. Those from Spanish-speaking churches might not. The US-based Apostolic Assembly of the Faith in Christ Jesus (AAFCJ) and its sister Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús (IAFCJ) of Mexico date their practice of Jesus' name baptism to as early as 1909, predating the events of 1913 at Arroyo Seco.⁵ The differing origin narratives have resulted in different heroes and heroines of the faith as well, with each denomination centering its histories around a variety of figures. For the predominantly white churches,

men like Andrew Urshan (the Persian Evangelist) and Howard Goss (the Texas revivalist) take center stage. In the now mostly Black PAW and its daughter denominations, founders G. T. Haywood and Robert C. Lawson are accorded pride of place. For churches with shared origins in the borderlands, figures like Francisco Llorente and Antonio Nava, founders of the AAFCJ, and Romana Carbajal de Valenzuela, founding matriarch of the IAFCJ, are commemorated.

These different origin stories help to explain the current diversity within the Oneness Pentecostal Movement. This volume offers readers the chance to develop an understanding of the ways in which race, gender, and sometimes class impacted the growth of the movement. Oneness Pentecostals were not and are not a homogeneous group. The experiences of any particular member of the ministry or laity could be influenced by their social status, race, sex, location/setting, or a combination of such factors. The chapters of this volume explore these themes and identify further areas of investigation; *Oneness Pentecostalism: Race, Gender, and Culture* can be considered, then, as an initial overdue foray into this topic in the broader fields of Pentecostal studies and North American religious history.

The color line was washed away in the blood of Christ.⁶

*If our Lord would return to the earth again in the flesh,
and would go down South incognito, he would be jim-crowed and segregated.⁷*

Foremost among the themes of these chapters is the issue of race and ethnicity; the church was not exempt from conflict along these lines. The church leaders of the 1920s and 1930s found themselves constantly revisiting conflicts over race. In his 1925 retrospective, Azusa Street eyewitness and chronicler Frank Bartleman penned one of the most famous proclamations concerning the Revival: “The color line was washed away in the blood of Christ” (a riposte to W. E. B. Du Bois’s dismal 1903 prophecy on race relations in the looming twentieth century).⁸ In that same year, Church of Our Lord Jesus Christ (COOLJC) founder (and PAW dissident) Robert C. Lawson offered a much less triumphant take on the state of race relations in American Christianity generally and in Oneness Pentecostalism in particular: “If our Lord would return to the earth again in the flesh, and would go down South incognito, he would be jim-crowed and segregated.”⁹ While Bartleman nostalgically celebrated Azusa’s interracial harmony, Lawson lamented its decline. The 1920s concluded the “golden age”

of Pentecostalism, a time of theological and social breakups, on the one hand, and an era of denomination-building, on the other.¹⁰

Despite Pentecostals' best efforts, by the 1920s the color line had been resituated across Pentecostalism's social fabric. Although at moments between the 1910s and the 1930s, the PAW would be the most racially integrated Pentecostal denomination, racial harmony over the long term proved difficult to sustain.¹¹ If the 1910s figured as an era of doctrinal definition, the following two decades prefigured subsequent and distinct social trajectories. And no social issue tested Oneness Pentecostals more than race. The legion withstood exorcism, however, owing to white Southern ministers' sensibilities and actions.

The PAW entered the 1920s with a racially integrated leadership board as a result of mergers from 1918 and 1919. The interracial board, however, proved a short-lived endeavor. In 1924 Southern ministers broke with the racially integrated PAW, inflicting damage by (1) holding their own segregated conferences in 1923 and 1924, (2) clamoring for the annual convention to be held in the South, where Blacks would be excluded under Jim Crow laws, (3) refusing credentials signed by African American executive board member G. T. Haywood, and (4) promoting a name change to the PAW and advocating for segregated branches within the organization. And although it is difficult to ascertain its impact, others objected to interracial marriages such as the one conducted by William Booth-Clibborn in St. Paul, Minnesota.¹² White Pentecostals not only chose to break with the interracial efforts, but some also wished to maintain the segregated order of the day. To suggest that the division was merely utilitarian because segregation posed barriers to effective evangelism and growth obscures the racial dynamics at play within the movement at that time.

Over the next two decades, independent white coreligionists joined the defecting Southern ministers in a course chartering new organizations and mergers. By the end of 1924, the PAW's ministerial roster was only about 20 percent white. In 1931 Haywood would lead the PAW in a final effort toward racial reconciliation, forming the Pentecostal Assemblies of Jesus Christ (PAJC) with white ministers. Haywood died that year, but the fellowship continued until 1937, when the PAJC held its annual convention in Tulsa and informed its African American constituency and leaders that they had made no accommodations for them. Fortunately for the PAW, Samuel Grimes, a protégé of Haywood, had possessed the foresight to renew the PAW charter in 1931 after Haywood vacated it.¹³ This allowed Black ministers—and some white allies—to regroup under the PAW banner.

While the exclusionary subterfuge did not provoke a full-frontal critique from PAW quarters, one prophetic voice had emerged by 1925: that of Robert C. Lawson. The Haywood protégé had parted ways with his mentor in 1919 and headed east from Ohio to Harlem. His Refuge Temple represented one of the most successful Oneness Pentecostal ministries in the country and garnered the esteem of both the Harlem community and the larger African American uplift movement. Lawson's 1925 *An Anthropology of Jesus Christ Our Kinsman* offered a robust, scripturally based critique lambasting the Jim Crow inhospitality of both American society and white Pentecostals.¹⁴

Several scholars have noted that Oneness Pentecostals have historically been "more characteristically Pentecostal than their Trinitarian counterparts."¹⁵ The movement was more steadfast in its retention of some of Pentecostalism's core spiritual practices and incubated an environment that has been "more compatible with an Afro-centric worldview than with that of non-Pentecostal white evangelicals."¹⁶ In a similar vein, James Tinney argued that Oneness Pentecostalism represents "the survival and renewal of African impulses," and that its "New Issue" heterodoxy exemplified a "rejection of white attempts to harness and define the Pentecostal work of the Spirit." Tinney characterized this as a "counter reformation."¹⁷ Another scholar, Joseph Howell, notes how Oneness Pentecostals engendered a "counter reformation of the Azusa revival" in its fourfold goal to recapture the early revival's vitality; thwart the theologizing experience; reaffirm the eschatological zeal; and revive interracial fellowship.¹⁸ In the decades after the exodus from the AG, Oneness Pentecostalism would grow disproportionately among African Americans and Latinos; at times, the separate subaltern trajectories converged, especially in musical expressions and borrowings.

While racial tensions embroiled Black and white Pentecostalism, another stream of the movement emerged from the Azusa Street Revival. Mexican Oneness Pentecostals (Apostólicos) forged a different trajectory as they ministered primarily to Spanish-speakers. Apostólico patriarchs Francisco Llorente, Marcial de la Cruz, and Antonio Nava, among others, received ministerial credentials from the PAW (so did several women as deaconesses). In 1925, while still under PAW auspices, they formed their own smaller unofficial fellowship: Iglesia de la Fe Apostólica Pentecostés. The delegates from over two dozen churches gathered in San Bernardino, California, and continued to meet annually at different sites, including one across the border in the Colonia Zaragoza agrarian commune in Mexicali, Baja California. In 1929, they decided to formally seek their own charter and in the following year formed the Apostolic Assembly of

the Faith in Christ Jesus (AAFCJ). Nava, the leader, helped unify the denomination's counterpart in Mexico in 1933, bringing together the discrete and regionally scattered workers and congregations in Mexico. Concerned over the distracting divisions between his Black and white Anglophone counterparts, Nava separated from the regionally distant PAW and fastened ties with more proximate—geographically and culturally—coreligionists.¹⁹

Nevertheless, doctrinal disputes and competing charisma threatened the unity of Mexican Pentecostals both north and south of the border at the same time that Black and white Oneness Pentecostals faced their own internal conflicts. In Mexico, relatives and converts of Romana Carbajal de Valenzuela augmented the movement in the decade following her arrival, but beginning in 1925 the movement suffered several schisms. Notably, Francisco Borrego launched the Iglesia Evangélica del Consejo Espiritual Mexicano, maintaining a close affiliation with two self-styled prophets, Saúl and Silas, who split several Jesus' name churches. Likely influenced by spiritualist teachings popular in Mexico at that time, they, along with Borrego, emphasized dreams and visions, often above scripture. Their most famous convert, Eusebio Joaquín, would also assume a prophetic mantle and rechristen himself in 1926 as the Apostle Aarón, charged to restore the primitive church. Unlike Saúl and Silas, who fell into historical obscurity, Joaquín realized great success with his new denomination, Iglesia del Dios Vivo Columna y Apoyo de la Verdad, La Luz del Mundo, known more colloquially as La Luz del Mundo (Light of the world).²⁰

Set against the backdrop of centrifugal dynamics, many early leaders evinced a sentiment for unity in spirit while awaiting unity in belief. In one such fraught moment, pioneer Marcial de la Cruz's was reported to retreat in prayer and returned to a ministerial conclave with a moving anthem, "La Iglesia el Cuerpo de Cristo" (The Church the Body of Christ):

*Somos un cuerpo en Cristo, con diferente don. . . .
Y si en acuerdo vamos, crece la caridad.
(We are one body in Christ, with different gifts. . . .
And if we proceed in unity, love will grow.)²¹*

In the face of threatened fragmentation and implosion, some Apostólicos discovered the strength of transnational solidarity, exchanging personnel and material in a process that tied sister flagship denominations: the AAFCJ of the United States and the Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús (IAFCJ) of Mexico. The exchange was unwittingly prompted, in part, by American xenophobia.

As US elites cast about for scapegoats to blame for the Great Depression, they settled on perennial ones: Mexicans. A concerted campaign between all levels of government and charitable agencies successfully pushed about one out of every three of the 1.3 million Mexicans residing in the country back to Mexico. The Great Repatriation (1929–39) also uprooted scores of thousands of US-born children and about the same ratio of Apostólicos. This is not surprising, as Pentecostals occupied the same humble strata as their vulnerable countrymen. What is remarkable, though, is their intrepid response. Rather than lament their circumstances, believers purposely set about evangelizing villages, towns, and agrarian communes in their native states, consolidated the movement in Mexico, and fastened fraternal bonds in the form of formal cross-border ecclesial accords in 1944–45: a joint Constitution and Treaty of Unification. The timely accords reinforced a practice of solidarity during subsequent periods of labor and family migration (e.g., the guest-worker Bracero Program, 1942–64) and missionary expansion (supported by the newly formed United Pentecostal Church) to Central America (1948) and the Southern Cone (1951). The first missionary expansion was fired by evangelistic reports from World War II Mexican American soldiers evangelizing in the Philippines and among Spanish refugees in France and facilitated by the bilingual gifts of a young leader, Isidro Pérez, who had been caught up in the Great Repatriation as a child and later studied at Apostolic Bible Institute, a UPC-endorsed Bible college in Tulsa, Oklahoma. Missionary endeavors in the Southern Cone began in response to a Macedonian call for help from diasporic Soviet Apostolics in Paraguay and Argentina (the religious progeny of Andrew D. Urshan). Notably, as Apostolicism inserted itself into a Mexican landscape beset by Herculean struggle between an ascendant liberal and revolutionary regime and a recalcitrant Catholic church (e.g., the Cristero War, 1926–29), believers affirmed historical ties and created defensive alliances with other beleaguered *evangélicos*. The shared circumstances attenuated the usual combative introversion of Oneness Pentecostalism at least in Mexico. The more peaceable spirit resulted in national leadership opportunities, including IAFCJ presiding bishop Manuel Gaxiola's presidency of the Mexican Bible Society and Adoniram Gaxiola's interlocution between the Carlos Salinas administration and Protestant churches during the historical 1992 constitutional reforms over religion.

The comparative analytical possibilities concerning the variables of migration and diaspora in different historical and social settings are promising. The Great Repatriation transpired, not coincidentally, at a time when California witnessed an influx of the so-called Okie migrants (to join the large Mexican

agricultural labor force) from the states impacted by the Dust Bowl of the late 1920s and 1930s. The Dust Bowl, an American saga popularized by John Steinbeck's 1939 novel *The Grapes of Wrath*, stirred up a long-term change in the religious and political ethos in California, with the lower counties of the San Joaquin Valley undergoing the most extensive southernization. Pentecostalism boomed in California in large part due to migration from the South (including Arkansas and Texas) and developed a staunch religiously conservative culture that persists to this day.²² White Pentecostal migrants, however, were not the only ones to introduce a new ethos and practice to migration destinations. Black Pentecostal Southerners, too, transformed the environments they entered, as made especially evident during the Great Migration. Pentecostals introduced a "new sacred order," challenging the existing culture of worship, music, preaching, and social concern.²³ An uptick in migration from Black, brown, and white migrants, thus, spread and transformed Oneness Pentecostalism. Discrete regional differences within denominations attest to legacies of migration and the social adaptability migration engenders. The analytical possibilities are promising. For example, the earlier migratory trajectories of celebrated pioneers like Frank Ewart and Andrew D. Urshan await critical study that can nuance the discussion of their theological contributions.

This long-overdue exploration of the movement's variegated origin points and streams expands the number of variables to consider. In the case of the three racial/ethnic groups under study, proletarian migration and racial or ethnic resistance can be added to the analytical mix. In the case of Mexico and the US Southwest, xenophobic persecution, religious intolerance, and transnational agency are also evident. Throughout, questions of gender and musical culture beg further exploration and analysis.

BOOK ROADMAP

Oneness Pentecostalism: Race, Gender, and Culture approaches North American Oneness Pentecostalism through an interdisciplinary lens. The reader will find chapters from the disciplines of history, anthropology, theology, and even architectural studies. Such interdisciplinary approaches are valuable because they provide the reader with multiple ways to understand the movement. For example, historians are able to look back and acknowledge the long-term impact of events, while sociologists tend to document life as it happens but are limited to the immediate moment. These varied disciplines all are key to understanding the movement.

The volume begins by paying tribute to the work of historical theologian Manuel Gaxiola (d. 2014) with the inclusion of his essay, “The Unresolved Issue: A Third-World Perspective on the Oneness Question” as chapter 1. The meditation, delivered to the 1987 meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies, and prior to that to a 1984 Harvard Divinity School symposium, laid out some of the important ambiguities and unfinished tasks addressed in this volume. A veteran executive and presiding bishop of the IAFCJ of Mexico, Gaxiola was among the first Latin American Pentecostals to earn a doctoral degree (with Walter Hollenweger at the University of Birmingham, 1989, and after master’s studies with church growth theorist Donald McGavran at Fuller Theological Seminary). His is accorded pride of place as an important academic and theological voice from the Pentecostal global South. A participant at such gatherings as the World Council of Church’s 1973 meeting in Bangkok, the 1974 Lausanne Conference, and observer of the International Roman Catholic–Pentecostal Dialogue (1972–82), Gaxiola urgently sought the theological maturation of the Apostolic Pentecostal Movement. He noted the significant global growth of the movement and predicted that it could no longer be ignored or dismissed by other Pentecostals, especially in countries like Mexico, Nicaragua, and Colombia, where they represented flagship *evangélico* denominations. Yet, with growth and maturity came an urgent task of clearer self-understanding.

The next three chapters of the volume focus on the theology of the movement and its earliest expressions from its theologians to its more popular form in music. In chapter 2, historical theologian David Reed traces the development of Oneness Pentecostal theology through its connections to prior evangelical movements and practices. He concludes that a robust Christology, emphasis on the name of God, and publications of the day provided the foundations of their Jesus’ name heterodoxy, which challenged the Trinitarian view of the godhead that dominates North American Protestantism. Historian Daniel Ramírez furthers this work in chapter 3, as he examines early Oneness hymnody to demonstrate the more popular expressions of this theology. Songs were often shared across denominations and languages as a way to resist a Trinitarian-leaning Protestant orthodoxy and hegemonic Catholicism, and to catechize converts. In chapter 4, historical theologian Daniel Seagraves provides readers with a detailed exploration of pioneer Andrew D. Urshan’s theological trajectory in order to understand more fully the noted Persian Evangelist’s conversance with Middle Eastern theological categories as he fashioned a Oneness Christology. In this section, the contributions of immigrants to the development of Oneness theology in America is emphasized over the traditional story of

theological development rooted solely in William Durham's Finished Work salvation schema.

The remainder of the volume continues to build on the diverse origins and developments of the movement. In the fifth and sixth chapters, the authors explore the ways in which migratory movements of the 1920s and 1930s led to churches with distinct attributes that reflected their settlement and development in various regions. In chapter 5, historian Lloyd D. Barba examines how migrants from the "Dust Bowl" area of the Western South overwhelmed and ultimately transformed the earlier, more cosmopolitan generation of Pentecostals in California. Specifically, in the Central Valley, migrants from the Western South brought with them a no-compromise hard-liner strain of Pentecostalism that centered on ideas of being tough on doctrine and fashioned or reinforced strict holiness standards of dress. This transplanted ethos took deep root among the valley's booming population of Okies, Arkies, and Texans. While the groups (collectively lumped together as "Okies") developed a hard-liner, conservative strain of Pentecostalism during their migratory journey, African American Oneness Pentecostals uprooted by the Great Migration developed a social justice ethos driven by their faith. Scholar Rosa Sailes in chapter 6 tracks how three generations of the Brazier family in Chicago utilized their pastoral platform to bring about change for the African American community. The Braziers arrived as one of millions of families in the Great Migration who made their way from the rural South into urban areas of the North. Each generation of Braziers was deeply invested in the struggle for dignity and justice, culminating in the celebrated Woodlawn Organization. These chapters serve as examples of the ways in which different Oneness groups, built on congregations formed by and straddling migratory movements, diverged to arrive at different political and social commitments.

Sailes's chapter also demonstrates the importance of gender in the development of the movement. Her chapter details the struggles and triumphs of Geneva Brazier and serves as a reminder that Black women in ministry have consistently found themselves limited by both their race and gender. In the seventh chapter, historian Dara Coleby Delgado continues this theme by examining how the roles of women have changed within the predominantly African American PAW. From debates over women in the pulpit to the more recent elevation of women to the bishopric, Coleby Delgado argues that increased gender equality has its limitations, and that PAW women challenge the notion that only the male body can truly represent Christ. In chapter 8, historian Andrea Shan Johnson extends this volume's analysis of women in the ministry as she

explores the ways in which predominantly white female ministers in the early years of the movement carved out a ministerial niche even while facing barriers put in place by male leaders. She finds that they often turned to pulpits in smaller congregations or to work on the mission field as a way to carry out their calling. They were circumspect in challenging gender norms of the day, but this circumspection came at a cost. Her work calls for further consideration of how women in ministry are presented in the broader historical narrative. These chapters collectively remind the reader of the ways that race and gender often intersect to enhance or limit the opportunities available to women seeking to exercise their gifts in the pulpit.

With the work of anthropologist Patricia Fortuny in chapter 9, the volume shifts the focus from the pulpit to the pews. Using the ethnographic tools of anthropology, Fortuny reflects on her years of association with female members of La Luz del Mundo, a denomination that has experienced recent considerable growth on both sides of the Mexican and American border. Adherents of Oneness Pentecostalism are often noted for their strict holiness dress codes and behavior, and these women clearly articulate the value that they find in living this distinctive sectarian life. Fortuny, however, explains that these women uniquely apply ostensibly standard church teachings and practices in pursuit of personal life projects and goals. In chapter 10, the volume offers readers an architectural analysis of the physical spaces that worshippers construct and inhabit. Historical theologian Daniel Chiquete's chapter on the spatial and architectural dimensions of Apostolic temples in Sinaloa, Mexico, considers how space, liturgy, aesthetics, and design influence the aspects of worship but also reflect regional influences. This northwestern state was among the very earliest regions evangelized by pioneer ministers, beginning with repatriated ones in the 1930s. Today it represents one of Apostolicism's strongest redoubts in that country, with considerable influence in the US Southwest through migration. The inevitable Charismatic and Neo-Pentecostal spin-offs have intensified the historical cross-fertilization with broader *evangelico* movements, especially Trinitarian ones, and especially in the area of worship and liturgy. These two chapters also remind us of how the movement successfully rode the ebbs and flows of twentieth-century globalization.

PAST SCHOLARSHIP AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

This volume represents the first academic interdisciplinary book on Oneness Pentecostalism. Accordingly, these chapters open up the study of Oneness

Pentecostalism in North America, reveal the diversity of the movement, and point to the significance of that diversity. Early academic scholarship showed promise but failed to produce fruit in 1984 when Harvard Divinity School hosted the First Occasional Symposium on Aspects of the Oneness Pentecostal Movement. The papers presented at the symposium were compiled by Jeffery Gill of Harvard Divinity School but remain stored in select seminary archives with only limited accessibility to the public.

Most book-length histories of the movement have been published through church presses or independent religious publishing houses, with the Word Aflame Press offering valuable reprints of early volumes. These chronicles represent the earnest efforts to document the origins and development of the movement, but these works have largely been written for a church readership. Some of these published books attempt to tell the history of particular denominations while others chronicle the movement more broadly. Such broad histories include, among others: Frank Ewart's *The Phenomenon of Pentecost* (1947), Maclovio Gaxiola's *Historia de la Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús de México* [History of the Apostolic Church of the Faith in Christ Jesus] (1964), the AAFCJ's semicentennial volume, *La Historia de la Asamblea Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús* [The History of the Apostolic Assembly of the Faith in Christ Jesus] (1966), Arthur Clanton's *United We Stand* (1970), and Morris Golder's *History of the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World* (1973).²⁴ Some more recent works represent a return to the biography format favored by early chroniclers. These include Daniel L. Segraves's *Andrew D. Urshan: A Theological Biography* (2017), published by an academic religious press, and historical theologian Robin Johnston's *Howard Goss: A Pentecostal Life* (2010), published by the academic imprint of the United Pentecostal Church International's (UPCI) Word Aflame Press.²⁵ Notably, several books, such as Manuel Gaxiola's *La Serpiente y La Paloma: Análisis del Crecimiento de la Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús de México* [The Serpent and the Dove: Analysis of the Growth of the Apostolic Church of the Faith in Christ Jesus in Mexico] (1970) and historian Talmadge French's *Our God Is One* (1999), began as master's theses and later enjoyed a wide readership within Oneness Pentecostal circles when they were published by religious and missionary presses.²⁶ One notable denominational effort was undertaken by the IAFCJ to commemorate its 2014 centenary.²⁷ A crowd-sourced WikiHistoria platform commissioned by the Comisión de Investigación Histórica [Historical Research Commission] and populated with individual congregations' historical projects from around the country provided a wealth of material that allowed a team helmed by Domingo Torres to produce a volume of

essays on several themes (history, missions, music, women, Christian education, etc.).²⁸ Critical scholarly examinations of the origins and development of key Oneness doctrines have been taken up extensively by historian Thomas Fudge in *Christianity Without a Cross: A History of Salvation in Oneness Pentecostalism* (2003) and Douglas Jacobsen in *Thinking in the Spirit: Theologies of the Early Pentecostal Movement* (2003), as well as by David Reed, who turned his 1978 dissertation into the book *"In Jesus' Name": The History and Beliefs of Oneness Pentecostals* (2008).²⁹

Other notable academic monographs closely examine aspects of the movement through a more intimate ethnographic or historical lens. Elaine Lawless's 1988 and 2005 books on women in independent Oneness Pentecostal churches in the Midwest and the US South, and Felicitas Goodman's study of glossolalia and related phenomena among Yucatec Mayan Apostolic women in Mexico focus on limited geographic and ethnic populations.³⁰ Historians Robert Mapes Anderson and Grant Wacker folded Oneness protagonists into their histories of early US Pentecostals, but did not focus necessarily on doctrinal and other distinctives.³¹ Talmadge French's *Early Interracial Oneness Pentecostalism* (2014) revisits the origins of the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World and the shifts in interracial leadership by examining numerous primary sources. Daniel Ramírez's *Migrating Faith: Pentecostalism in the United States and Mexico in the Twentieth Century* (2015) examines the long history of the Apostolic Movement in the US and Mexico and the shared borderlands, recovering history through music and migration flows. The Luz del Mundo's notoriety has created a virtual (and critical) academic cottage industry in Mexico.³² Judith Casselberry's *The Labor of Faith: Gender and Power in Black Apostolic Pentecostalism* (2017) discusses the various kinds of labor women of the Church of Our Lord Jesus Christ (COOLJC) undertake to advance their causes and work around patriarchal church structures. Most recently, Lloyd D. Barba's *Sowing the Sacred: Mexican Pentecostal Farmworkers in California* (2022) demonstrates how Mexican Pentecostal farmworkers claimed space and carved out a sense of personhood in the punishing world of industrial agriculture. These rigorous assessments of the movement showcase important theological, historical, gender, and anthropological dimensions of the movement. They signal an academic turn in the study of Oneness Pentecostalism.

The above-mentioned publications, in addition to sundry articles and stand-alone chapters, attest to the cultural vibrancy of the Oneness Pentecostal Movement.³³ But much work remains. One auspicious and recent endeavor came to fruition in the 2013 inauguration of the Manuel Gaxiola and Manuel Vizcarra

collections at the David Allan Hubbard Library of Fuller Theological Seminary. The UPCI's recent opening of the Center for the Study of Oneness Pentecostalism also bodes well for the historical preservation of the movement. Efforts by Alexander Stewart and Sherry Sherrod Dupree to compile bibliographies of the Black Oneness Pentecostal Movements and leaders and to archive material in such places as Harlem's Arthur Schomburg Library further enhance our knowledge of the movement's origins and developments. Numerous grassroots efforts have aimed at preserving music and photographs on social media sites and YouTube. We encourage those with relevant materials to seek out trustworthy archivists such as those noted above. The work of historians can only be as good as the material available. The preserved past determines the stories we tell.

Finally, it is tempting to refract the history of Oneness Pentecostalism in North America through the aspirational lens of current attempts to unify the movement around a common "Apostolic Identity." This would be anachronistic; the aspirations are too often tied to national political agendas of the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. This volume offers a sobering reminder that disparate, discreet, and often conflictive origins made for distinct trajectories over the course of a century in a single continent. The work of reconstructing those trajectories, including in wider hemispheric and global dimensions, has only begun. The half has not yet been told.

NOTES

1. Johnston, "Pictorial Essay," 42–43.
2. Ewart, *Phenomenon*, 76–77; Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, 156. We have chosen to utilize the spelling "Jesus' name" in keeping with scholarship on the movement.
3. Johnson, "Shudder Swept."
4. Barba and Johnson, "New Issue." According to Grant Wacker, the success of Pentecostalism lay within believer's ability to hold primitivist and pragmatic impulses in productive tension; see Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 10.
5. Barba and Johnson, "New Issue"; these origin stories are also complicated globally. Russian Pentecostals, for example, trace their Oneness origins to the missionary journeys of Andrew D. Urshan, who baptized in Jesus' name as early as 1910. See Fletcher, *Soviet Charismatics*.
6. Bartleman, *Azusa Street*, 51.
7. Lawson, *Anthropology of Jesus Christ*, 32.
8. Bartleman, *Azusa Street*, 51. Du Bois famously declared that "the problem of the Twentieth Century is the problem of the color line," see Du Bois, *Souls*, 3.
9. On Lawson's views of race and the US church, see Barba, "Jesus Would Be Jim-Crowed."
10. Sánchez-Walsh, *Pentecostals in America*, xxi. By 1929, no fewer than thirty Oneness (including many African American) denominations populated the Pentecostal landscape. Most of these merged with others, but some persist to this day, such as the Birmingham-based

Apostolic Overcoming Holy Church of God. French, *Our God*, 85–125; Alexander, *Black Fire*, 206–48. Joe Creech and Alan Anderson’s trenchant arguments for multipolar Pentecostal origins—national in the case of Creech and global in the case of Anderson—may ratchet down the Azusa Street Revival’s primacy but not its significance for a critical historiography of race, ethnicity, and religion. Creech, “Visions of Glory”; Anderson, *To the Ends*, 17–18.

11. Ramírez, *Migrating Faith*, 35.

12. Brown, “Oneness Pentecostalism and Ethnicity,” 131; French, *Early Interracial*, 146–51, 163–76; Tyson, *Early Pentecostal Revival*, 241–53; Reed, *In Jesus’ Name*, 207–18; Golder, *History of the Pentecostal*, 82–83.

13. Reed, *In Jesus’ Name*, 215–18.

14. Barba, “Jesus Would Be Jim-Crowed.”

15. *Ibid.*, 82; other earlier histories of the Pentecostal Movement agree with these historical qualities of Oneness Pentecostalism. See Blumhofer, *Restoring the Faith*, 187–93.

16. Reed, *In Jesus’ Name*, 82.

17. Tinney, “Significance of Race,” 56–57.

18. Howell, “People of the Name,” 5.

19. Ramírez, *Migrating Faith*, 48; Gill, *Toward a Contextualized Theology*, 41–59. In 1946 the denomination in Mexico changed its name to Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús to differentiate itself from its US counterpart.

20. Gill, *Toward a Contextualized Theology*, 41–59; Gaxiola, *La Serpiente y La Paloma*.

21. de la Cruz, “Iglesia.”

22. Gregory, *American Exodus*; Dochuk, *From Bible Belt*.

23. Best, *Passionately Human*.

24. Ewart, *The Phenomenon*; Foster, *Think It Not Strange*; Gaxiola López, *Historia de la Iglesia*; Cantú et al., *Historia de la Asamblea*; Clanton, *United We Stand*; Golder, *History*; Tyson, *Early Pentecostal Revival*. See also the first five chapters of Bernard, *History of Christian Doctrine*.

25. Johnston, *Howard Goss*; Segraves, *Andrew D. Urshan*.

26. Gaxiola, *La Serpiente y la Paloma*; French, *Our God Is One*.

27. Torres Alvarado, *Cien Años*.

28. IAFCJ 2014 Comisión de Investigación Histórica, <https://historia.iafcj.org/Bienvenidos>, accessed March 17, 2020.

29. Fudge, *Christianity*; Reed, *In Jesus’ Name*.

30. Goodman, *Speaking in Tongues*; Goodman, *Maya Apocalypse*; Lawless, *Handmaidens*; Lawless, *God’s Peculiar People*; Ramírez, *Migrating Faith*; Casselberry, *Labor of Faith*; Barba, *Sowing the Sacred*.

31. Anderson, *Vision of the Disinherited*; Wacker, *Heaven Below*.

32. Masferrer, *Luz del Mundo*; de la Torre, *Hijos de la Luz*. On June 3, 2022, the Luz del Mundo’s leader, Apostle Naasón Joaquín García, pleaded guilty in Los Angeles, California, to sexually abusing three girls, receiving a nearly seventeen-year sentence.

33. Barba and Johnson, “New Issue.”

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alexander, Estrela. *Black Fire: One Hundred Years of African American Pentecostalism*. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity Press, 2011.

Anderson, Alan H. *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.

- Anderson, Robert Mapes. *Vision of the Disinherited*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1979.
- Barba, Lloyd. "Jesus Would Be Jim Crowed: Bishop Robert Lawson on Race and Religion in the Harlem Renaissance." *Journal of Race, Ethnicity, and Religion* 6, no. 3 (2015): 1–32.
- . *Sowing the Sacred: Mexican Pentecostal Farmworkers in California*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2022.
- Barba, Lloyd, and Andrea Shan Johnson. "The New Issue: Approaches to Oneness Pentecostalism in the United States." *Religion Compass* 12, no. 11 (2018).
- Bartleman, Frank. *Azusa Street: An Eyewitness Account to the Birth of the Pentecostal Revival*. New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 1982. First privately printed 1925 (Los Angeles).
- Bernard, David K. *A History of Christian Doctrine: The Twentieth Century*. Hazelwood, MO: Word Aflame Press, 2007.
- Best, Wallace. *Passionately Human, No Less Divine: Religion and Culture in Black Chicago, 1915–1952*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007.
- Blumhofer, Edith. *Restoring the Faith: The Assemblies of God, Pentecostalism, and American Culture*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993.
- Brown, Roderick R. "Oneness Pentecostalism and Ethnicity: A Decision out of Step." Master's thesis, University of South Dakota, 2005.
- Cantú, Ernesto S., José A. Ortega, Isaac Cota, and Phillip Rangel. *Historia de La Asamblea Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús, 1916–1966* [History of the Apostolic Assembly of the Faith in Christ Jesus]. Mentone, CA: Sal's Printing Service, 1966.
- Casselberry, Judith. *The Labor of Faith: Gender and Power in Black Apostolic Pentecostalism*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2017.
- Clanton, Arthur L. *United We Stand—A History of Oneness Organizations*. Hazelwood, MO: Pentecostal Publishing House, 1970.
- Creech, Joe. "Visions of Glory: The Place of the Azusa Street Revival in Pentecostal History." *Church History* 65, no. 3 (1996): 405–24.
- Cruz, Marcial de la, composer. "La Iglesia, el Cuerpo de Cristo." No. 254 in *Himnario de suprema alabanza a Jesús*. 6th ed. Zapopan, Jalisco: Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús, 1996.
- Dochuk, Darren. *From Bible Belt to Sunbelt: Plain Folk Religion, Grassroots Politics, and the Rise of Evangelical Conservatism*. New York: W. W. Norton Press, 2011.
- Du Bois, W. E. B. *The Souls of Black Folk*. 1903. Repr., New York: Fine Creative Media, 2003.
- Ewart, Frank J. *Phenomenon of Pentecost: A History of the Latter Rain*. Houston, TX: Herald, 1947.
- Fletcher, William. *Soviet Charismatics: The Pentecostals in the USSR*. New York: Peter Lang, 1985.
- Foster, Fred J. *Think It Not Strange: A History of the Oneness Movement*. St. Louis: Pentecostal Publishing House, 1965.
- French, Talmadge. *Early Interracial Oneness Pentecostalism: G. T. Haywood and the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World, 1901–1931*. Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2014.
- . *Our God Is One: The Story of the Oneness Pentecostals*. Indianapolis: Voice and Vision, 1999.
- Fudge, Thomas. *Christianity Without the Cross: A History of Salvation in Oneness Pentecostalism*. Parkland, FL: Universal Publishers, 2003.
- Gaxiola Gaxiola, Manuel J. *La serpiente y la paloma: Análisis del crecimiento de*

- la Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús de México* [The Serpent and the Dove: Analysis of the Growth of the Apostolic Church of the Faith in Christ Jesus in Mexico]. South Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 1970.
- . *La serpiente y la paloma: Historia, teología y análisis de la Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús, 1914–1994* [The Serpent and the Dove: History, Theology and Analysis of the Apostolic Church of the Faith in Christ Jesus, 1914–1994]. 2nd ed., corregida y aumentada. México, D.F.: Libros Pyros, 1994.
- Gaxiola López, Maclovio. *Historia de La Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús de México* [History of the Apostolic Church of the Faith in Christ Jesus of Mexico]. Mexico City: La Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús, 1964.
- Gill, Kenneth. *Toward a Contextualized Theology for the Third World: The Emergence and Development of Jesus' Name Pentecostalism in Mexico*. Bern, Switzerland: Peter Lang International, 1994.
- Golder, Morris E. *History of the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World*. Indianapolis: Self-published, 1973.
- Goodman, Felicitas. *Maya Apocalypse: Seventeen Years with the Women of a Yucatán Village*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001.
- . *Speaking in Tongues: A Cross-Cultural Study of Glossolalia*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1972.
- Gregory, James. *American Exodus: The Dust Bowl Migration and Okie Culture in California*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1989.
- Howell, Joseph. "The People of the Name: Oneness Pentecostalism in the United States." PhD diss., Florida State University, 1985.
- Jacobsen, Douglas. *Thinking in the Spirit: Theologies of the Early Pentecostal Movement*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003.
- Johnson, Andrea Shan. "A Shudder Swept Through Them: An Identification of the Controversial Joshua Sykes." *Pneuma* 38, no. 3 (2016): 312–29.
- Johnston, Robin. *Howard Goss: A Pentecostal Life*. Hazelwood, MO: Word Aflame Press Academic, 2010.
- . "A Pictorial Essay of the Centennial Celebration of the Arroyo Seco Campmeeting." *Pentecostal Herald*, November 2013.
- Lawless, Elaine. *God's Peculiar People: Women's Voice and Folk Tradition in a Pentecostal Church*. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2005.
- . *Handmaidens of the Lord: Pentecostal Women Preachers and Traditional Religion*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988.
- Lawson, Robert C. *The Anthropology of Jesus Christ Our Kinsman*. Piqua, OH: Ohio Ministries, 2000. First printed in 1925 (New York).
- Masferrer, Elio. *La Luz del Mundo: Un análisis multidisciplinario de la controversia religiosa que ha impactado a nuestro país* [A Multidisciplinary Analysis of the Religious Controversy That Has Impacted Our Country]. Mexico City: Revista Académica para el Estudio de la Religiones, 1997.
- Ramírez, Daniel. *Migrating Faith, Pentecostalism in the United States and Mexico*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2015.
- Reed, David. *In Jesus' Name: The History and Beliefs of Oneness Pentecostals*. Blandford Forum, UK: Deo, 2008.
- Sánchez-Walsh, Arlene. *Pentecostals in America*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2018.
- Segraves, Daniel. *Andrew D. Urshan: A Theological Biography*. Lexington, KY: Emeth Press, 2017.

- Synan, Vinson. *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1997.
- Tinney, James S. "The Significance of Race in the Rise and Development of the Apostolic Pentecostal Movement." In *Papers Presented to the First Occasional Symposium on Aspects of the Oneness Pentecostal Movement*, 55–69. Cambridge: Harvard Divinity School, 1984.
- Torre, Renée de la. *Los Hijos de la luz: Discurso, identidad y poder en La Luz del Mundo* [The Children of the Light: Discourse, Identity, and Power in the Light of the World]. Tlaquepaque, Jalisco, Mexico: Instituto Tecnológico de Estudios Superiores de Occidente, 2000.
- Torres Alvarado, Domingo, ed. *Cien años de Pentecostés, desde la vivencia de la Iglesia Apostólica* [One Hundred Years of Pentecost in the Lived Experience of the Apostolic Church]. Zapopan, Mexico: Iglesia Apostólica de la Fe en Cristo Jesús, 2014.
- Tyson, James. *The Early Pentecostal Revival: History of Twentieth-Century Pentecostals and the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World, 1901–1930*. Hazelwood, MO: Word Aflame Press, 1990.
- Wacker, Grant. *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2001.